

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.

Plaintiffs,

v.

JETBLUE AIRWAYS CORPORATION and
SPIRIT AIRLINES, INC.

Defendants.

Case No. 1:23-cv-10511-WGY

GABRIEL GARAVANIAN, et al.

Plaintiffs,

v.

JETBLUE AIRWAYS CORPORATION and
SPIRIT AIRLINES, INC.

Defendants.

Case No. 1:23-cv-10678-WGY

**JOINT MOTION FOR ENTRY OF STIPULATED JOINT PROTECTIVE ORDER AND
ORDER GOVERNING PRODUCTION OF INVESTIGATION MATERIALS**

In accordance with Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and Rule 7.2 of the Local Civil Rules, all Parties to the Government Action and the Private Action respectfully move for entry of the attached Stipulated Joint Protective Order and Order Governing Production of Investigations Materials (“Joint Protective Order”) in both actions.¹

¹ The “Government Action” means *United States v. JetBlue Airways Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-10511-WGY, and the “Private Action” means *Garavanian v. JetBlue Airways Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-10678-WGY. The “Government” means the plaintiffs in the Government Action. The “Parties” means all parties to both actions.

The Parties have agreed to the proposed Joint Protective Order as a compromise to resolve one of the United States' objections to the proposed case management order in the Private Action, embodied in Paragraph 3 of the United States' May 3, 2023 Proposed Order (Private Action ECF No. 78-1). The proposed Joint Protective Order provides for disclosure of material from the Government Action in the Private Action, but only after non-parties that provided such material receive notice and the opportunity to object in the Private Action, as well as the same level of protection in the Private Action as in the Government Action. *See* Joint Protective Order ¶¶ 24-25, 29-30.²

WHEREFORE, the Parties respectfully request that the Court enter the attached proposed Joint Protective Order.³

Dated: May 26, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joseph M. Alioto Jr.

Joseph M. Alioto Jr.
ALIOTO LEGAL
100 Pine Street, Suite 1250
San Francisco, California 94111
joseph@aliotolegal.com

/s/ Stephen G. Larson

Stephen G. Larson
LARSON LLP
555 South Flower Street, Suite 4400
Los Angeles, California 90071
slarson@larsonllp.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Gabriel Garavanian, et al.

/s/ Edward W. Duffy

Edward W. Duffy
John M. Briggs
United States Department of Justice
Antitrust Division
450 Fifth Street, NW, Suite 4000
Washington, D.C. 20530
Telephone: (202) 812-4723
Fax: (202) 307-5802
Email: edward.duffy@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America

/s/ William T. Matlack

William T. Matlack (MA Bar No. 552109)
Office of the Attorney General
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor

² By submitting the proposed Joint Protective Order, none of the Parties takes a position on any objections that non-parties may make after receiving notice of the proposed Joint Protective Order.

³ The Parties are not at this time seeking to file any documents with the Court under seal. Rather, they wish to limit the dissemination of documents, testimony, and information provided by the Parties and non-parties during discovery. In accordance with Paragraph 48 of the proposed Order, the Parties will only file Confidential Information or Highly Confidential Information under seal pursuant to Local Rule 7.2 regarding Impoundment and Confidential Materials.

/s/ Elizabeth M. Wright

Elizabeth M. Wright (MA BBO #569387)
Zachary R. Hafer (MA BBO #569389)
COOLEY LLP
500 Boylston Street, 14th Floor
Boston, MA 02116
Telephone: (617) 937-2349
ewright@cooley.com
zhafer@cooley.com

Ethan Glass (*admitted pro hac vice*)
COOLEY LLP
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004
Telephone: (202) 842-7800
eglass@cooley.com

Richard Schwed (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Jessica Delbaum (*admitted pro hac vice*)
SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP
599 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10022
Telephone: (212) 848-4000
rschwed@shearman.com
jessica.delbaum@shearman.com

Ryan Shores (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Michael Mitchell (*admitted pro hac vice*)
SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP
401 9th Street, NW, Suite 800
Washington, D.C. 20004
Telephone: (202) 508-8108
ryan.shores@shearman.com
michael.mitchell@shearman.com

Rachel Mossman Zieminski (*admitted pro hac vice*)
SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP
2601 Olive Street, Suite 1700
Dallas, TX 75201
Telephone: (214) 271-5385
rachel.zieminski@shearman.com

Attorneys for Defendant JetBlue Airways Corporation

Boston, MA 02108

Telephone: (617) 727-2200

Email: William.Matlack@mass.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of Massachusetts

/s/ Olga Kogan

Olga Kogan (*admitted pro hac vice*)
New York State Office of the Attorney General
28 Liberty Street, 20th Floor
New York, NY 10005
Telephone: (212) 416-8262
Email: olga.kogan@ag.ny.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff the State of New York

/s/ C. William Margrabe

C. William Margrabe (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Office of the Attorney General
400 6th Street NW, Suite 10100
Washington, D.C. 20001
Telephone: (202) 727-6294
Email: will.margrabe@dc.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff the District of Columbia

/s/ Schonette J. Walker

Schonette J. Walker (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Gary Honick (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Byron Warren (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Maryland Office of the Attorney General
200 St. Paul Place, 19th Floor
Baltimore, MD 21202
410-576-6470
swalker@oag.state.md.us
ghonick@oag.state.md.us
bwarren@oag.state.md.us

Attorneys for Plaintiff State Maryland

/s/ Komal K. Patel

Komal K. Patel (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Deputy Attorney General
Office of the California Attorney General
300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702

/s/ Andrew C. Finch

Andrew C. Finch (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Jay Cohen (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Eytayo St. Matthew-Daniel (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Kate Wald (*admitted pro hac vice*)
PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP
1285 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10019
Telephone: (212) 373-3000
afinch@paulweiss.com
jaycohen@paulweiss.com
tstmatthewdaniel@paulweiss.com
kwald@paulweiss.com

Meredith Dearborn (*admitted pro hac vice*)
PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP
535 Mission Street, 24th Floor
San Francisco, California 94105
Telephone: (650) 208-2788
mdearborn@paulweiss.com

Attorneys for Defendant Spirit Airlines, Inc.

Los Angeles, CA 90013

Tel: (213) 269-6000

Email: Komal.Patel@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California

/s/ Bryan S. Sanchez

Bryan S. Sanchez (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Ana Atta-Alla (*admitted pro hac vice*)
State of New Jersey - Office of the Attorney General
Division of Law
124 Halsey Street – 5th Floor
Newark, New Jersey 07102
Telephone: (973) 648-6835
Bryan.Sanchez@law.njoag.gov
Ana.Atta-Alla@law.njoag.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of New Jersey

/s/ Jessica V. Sutton

Jessica V. Sutton (*admitted pro hac vice*)
Special Deputy Attorney General
North Carolina Department of Justice Post Office
Box 629
Raleigh, North Carolina 27602
Tel: 919-716-6000
E-mail: jsutton2@ncdoj.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff State of North Carolina

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on May 26, 2023, I filed the foregoing document with the United States District Court for the District of Massachusetts using the CM/ECF system, and caused it to be served on all registered participants via the notice of electronic filing (the “NEF”).

/s/ Elizabeth M. Wright

Elizabeth M. Wright